

**NAPERVILLE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA**

Thursday, January 28, 2010 – 7 p.m.

Meeting Rooms B and C

Naperville Municipal Center, 400 South Eagle Street, Naperville, Illinois

Special Accommodations: Any individual with a disability requiring a reasonable accommodation in order to participate in a meeting should contact the Division of Social Services 630/420-6001 (voice), 630/305-5205 (TDD) or the City Clerk's Office 630/305-5300 to coordinate ADA services. Please contact the City at least five working days in advance of the next scheduled meeting.

A. Call to Order and Roll Call

B. Approve Minutes from September 10, 2009

C. Old Business - None

D. Certificate of Appropriateness - None

E. Reports and Recommendations - None

F. Correspondence - None

G. New Business

1. Appointment of Vice Chair and Secretary of the Historic Preservation Commission
2. Presentation of Certificates of Appreciation to former members of the Historic Sites Commission
3. A Presentation by Paul H. Loscheider, Vice President for Business Affairs, North Central College

Paul H. Loscheider, Vice President of North Central College, will give a presentation regarding the College's history, the development of its relationship with the Historic District and the Historic Sites Commission, its recent renovations and new construction projects, and the endeavor to update the College's Master Land Use Plan. A draft of the College's Master Land Use Plan 2020 may be viewed at <http://northcentralcollege.edu/x50188.xml>.

H. Adjournment

MINUTES
NAPERVILLE HISTORIC SITES COMMISSION
September 10, 2009 - 8:00 P.M.
Municipal Meeting Rooms B and C

Call to Order	<u>Time:</u>	(8: 15 pm)	
A. Roll Call Commissioners:	<u>Present:</u> Kris Hartner Ron Swalwell Ann Edmonds Jamie Smith Denise Nigro	<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>
Staff Present:	Ying Liu – Community Planner Debbie Grinnell – Naper Settlement Samula McCarthy – Administrative Assistant		
B. Approve Minutes 8/12/09	Motion to approve with amendment by: Kris Hartner Seconded by: Denise Nigro	Approved (5 to 0)	
C. New Business			
1. COA #09-2555 6 South Loomis St.	<p><u>Owner and Petitioner:</u> Daniel Toner</p> <p><u>Request:</u> The owner requested consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to allow for a six-foot tall wood privacy fence to be maintained as constructed on the property at 6 S. Loomis Street and that the commission recommend approval for a variance request for the fence to encroach into the required 15’ corner side yard setback along Benton Avenue.</p> <p>The owner and petitioner, Mr. Toner gave an overview of the request. He stated that construction of the fence without permit was an inadvertent error as he was unaware of requirements for a building permit or a COA. Toner indicated that the fence is necessary to provide privacy due to the heavy pedestrian and vehicular traffic on Benton Avenue. The proposed fence is identical to a previous fence on the property with the exception that the new fence is a few feet closer to the sidewalk. Currently, the proposed fence is located approximately 6”-8” from the sidewalk.</p> <p>Toner mentioned that the application packet includes</p>		

	<p>signed petitions from neighbors to support the constructed fence. Mr. Toner stated that approval of his request would not set precedence for illegal construction in the neighborhood, as his case is unique due to the small size of his property, adjacency to a busy street, and the need for privacy.</p>	
	<p><u>Public Comments:</u></p> <p><u>Michele Young</u> of 416 E. Benton, <u>Dave Lowery</u> of 24 North Loomis St., <u>Jean Anderson</u> of 15 N. Loomis Street, <u>Steve Carr</u> of 8 North Loomis and <u>Lee Wills</u> of 18 South Loomis spoke in support of the petitioner's request and indicated that they have no objection to the style or location of the fence.</p> <p><u>Susan Fitch</u> of 32 South Wright Street referenced to a letter submitted on behalf of the ECHO Board in opposition to the requested COA. She stated that safety is a concern for having the fence so close to the sidewalk.</p>	

	<p><u>Historic Sites Commission Question/Discussion:</u></p> <p>Commissioner Edmonds received confirmation from staff that safety is not a factor in considering the COA, and that only the style and design of the fence are reviewed by the commission.</p> <p>Commissioner Nigro questioned how far the fence was moved from its original location and whether there is a utility easement in the corner side yard. The petitioner responded that the current fence is about 6” to 8” off the sidewalk. Staff member Liu responded that there is no easement in the corner side yard.</p> <p>Commissioner Edmonds inquired whether the previous fence was issued a COA. Staff member Liu responded that the previous fence was constructed prior to the establishment of the Historic District and the fence was probably a legal non-conforming fence without a COA.</p> <p>Edmonds inquired about staff’s recommendation on the setback variance. Staff member Liu stated that no application for the zoning variance was filed with the ZBA yet. However, if an application was filed, staff would make a recommendation based on the standards for granting a variance, which include whether there is a physical hardship associated with the property.</p> <p>Acting Chair Smith commented that based on her observation the fence does allow visibility through the wood panels of the fence.</p> <p>The commission discussed the uniqueness of the property and the appropriateness of the fence in the context of the character of the neighborhood.</p>	
	<p><u>Motion:</u> Approve COA #09-2555 to allow for the 6’ tall wood privacy fence, which is parallel to Loomis Street and Benton Avenue, to be maintained as constructed on the property at 6 S. Loomis Street and to incorporate all of the findings of fact of the September 2, 2009 staff’s memo.</p>	<p>Approved (5 to 0)</p>
	<p>Motion by: Ann Edmonds Seconded by: Kris Hartner</p>	

	<p><u>Motion:</u> Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a setback variance from Section 6-2-12:1.3 (Fences) to allow the 6' tall privacy fence to be maintained as constructed at a distance of 6"-8" from the sidewalk on the property at 6 S. Loomis Street, encroaching into the 15' corner side yard setback.</p> <p>Motion by: Ann Edmonds Seconded by: Kris Hartner</p> <p style="text-align: right;"><u>Nay (Nigro)</u></p> <p>Commission Nigro stated her reason for a dissenting vote is that the fence is too close to the sidewalk.</p> <p>Commissioner Edmonds stated that her favorable vote is based on the economic hardship of the petitioner if he was to be required to tear down the fence.</p>	<p>Approved (4 to 1)</p>
<p>2. COA #09-2590 427 East Chicago Ave.</p>	<p><u>Owner and Petitioner:</u> Bryce Elliot <u>Request:</u> The owner requested consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for an amendment to COA #99-05 to modify the design of the approved second-story rear addition and for siding replacement of the home.</p> <p>The owner Mr. Bryce Elliot gave an overview of the request, noting that the proposed design is more consistent with the style of the original house. The proposed second story addition would accommodate a master bedroom. The need for siding replacement is due to the difficulty of maintaining the existing cedar siding. Elliot stated that he wishes to repair and preserve the existing decorative features of the house.</p> <p><u>Public Comments:</u> None</p> <p><u>Historic Sites Commission Questions/Discussion:</u></p> <p>Commissioner Swalwell recommended that the petitioner insulate the walls of the property.</p> <p>Commissioner Edmonds received confirmation from the</p>	

	<p>petitioner that all of the home's clapboard siding will be replaced with fiber cement board. However, he would repair and preserve the decorative features on the house if possible.</p> <p>Commissioner Nigro inquired whether Naper Settlement would be interested in documenting the house before the addition.</p> <p>The preservation of the decorative elements was discussed. The Commission requested that if any of the decorative features needs to be replaced because of deterioration, the petitioner should work with Naper Settlement and city staff to determine appropriate replacement material and design.</p> <p>Debbie Grinnell of Naper Settlement responded that Naper Settlement staff will investigate their archives for photographs of the original house for the petitioner's use as guidelines in case replacement of the decorative features becomes necessary.</p>	
	<p>Motion: Approve COA #09-2590 for the property at 427 E. Chicago Avenue to allow for construction of a second story rear addition and replacement of the existing cedar siding of the home and aluminum siding of the garage with fiber cement board, subject to the conditions as stated in the staff memo dated September 2, 2009, with an additional condition that the petitioner shall work with city and Naper Settlement staff to repair or replace the existing decorative features on the house as necessary.</p> <p>Motion by: Kris Hartner Seconded by: Ron Swalwell</p>	<p>Approved (5 to 0)</p>
<p>3. HSC #09-02 12 South Loomis St.</p>	<p>Petitioner: Steve Carr representing the owners Glen and Lois Landgraf. Request: The petitioner requests that the commission recommend approval for two zoning variances to allow for construction of a detached garage at 20' in height and at a distance of 3.5' from the interior lot line (south) off the alley at the property of 12 S. Loomis Street.</p>	
	<p>Steve Carr gave an overview of the request. The owner wishes to erect a new garage located 3.5' from the south lot line encroaching into the interior side yard setback. The</p>	

	<p>current garage is non-conforming, located closer to the south lot line than the proposed garage. There is a large telephone pole in the middle of the lot that dictates the location of the proposed garage. The proposed garage is 22' by 30' in size and 19'9" in height. The zoning ordinance has an 18' height restriction on accessory structures; therefore the garage will need a 1'9" height variance.</p>	
	<p><u>Public Comments:</u></p> <p><u>Michele Young</u> of 416 E. Benton spoke in support of the petitioner's request. Young stated that the proposed garage would be located behind her house and she supports the new design. Young expressed concern regarding additional drainage created by the new pavement areas. Staff member Liu confirmed that a grading plan would be required and subject to the review of the Engineering Team.</p> <p><u>Lee Wills</u> of 18 South Loomis stated that she was not notified early enough to make a clear determination to support the project. She inquired whether the dead tree on the property would be removed. Carr responded that the dead tree would be removed and he would like to discuss the project with the neighbors in more detail. Staff member Liu noted that public notification letters will be sent out to adjacent property owners within 250' of the property for the public hearing before the Zoning Board of Appeals.</p>	
	<p><u>Historic Sites Commission Questions/Discussion:</u></p> <p>The commission discussed the variance request to the height restriction and what impact it has on the neighborhood.</p> <p>Acting Chair Smith commented that a garage within the height restriction would accommodate all the garage functions as desired by the petitioner.</p> <p>Nigro stated that the height restriction may be to maintain a safe distance from over head utility lines and expressed concern for maintenance of landscaping between the garage and the fence. The petitioner responded that the</p>	

	utility lines would be buried underground.	
	<u>Motion:</u> Recommend approval to the Zoning Board of Appeals for a height variance and a setback variance to allow construction of the proposed garage at 19'9" in height and at a distance of 3.5' from the interior (south) lot line.	Approved (4-1)
	Motion by: Ron Swalwell Seconded by: Ann Edmonds <p style="text-align: right;"><u>Nay (Smith)</u></p> Commissioner Nigro clarified that her vote was not meant to supersede ZBA's decision, but merely a recommendation.	
D. Adjournment	Motion to adjourn by: Ron Swalwell Seconded by: Kris Hartner	Approved (5 to 0)
	<u>Time:</u>	9:40 pm